

WELL GROUNDED

Using Local Land Use Authority to Achieve Smart Growth

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	1
Overview	9
Chapter 1	
What Is Local Land Use Law and Practice?	15
A. Local Authority	15
B. County and Regional Actions	16
C. Zoning and the Comprehensive Plan	16
D. Citizen Participation	17
E. Balancing Property Rights and the Public Interest: Limiting Doctrines.	17
F. Preemption, Partial Preemption, and Equity.	18
G. Zoning Practice	19
H. Local Boards.	21
I. Facilitation and Mediation.	21
J. Judicial Review	22
K. Subdivision and Site Plan Regulation: Community Development.	22
L. Local Environmental Review	23
M. Sustainable Development and Grass Roots Regionalism.	24
Chapter 2	
Local Land Use Controls that Achieve Smart Growth.	25
A. Designating Growth Districts	25
<i>Authority to Designate Growth Areas</i>	<i>26</i>
<i>Directing Growth to Designated Growth Areas</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>Techniques for Protecting the Designated Growth Area</i>	<i>29</i>
B. Smart Growth and Traditional Zoning—A Comparison.	29
<i>Conventional Zoning</i>	<i>30</i>
<i>Traditional Neighborhood District Zoning</i>	<i>31</i>
<i>Pawling’s Overlay Zoning Approach.</i>	<i>31</i>
C. Conservation Boundaries: Preserving Open Lands	33

<i>Overlay Zoning</i>	33
<i>Floating Zones</i>	34
<i>Cluster Development</i>	34
<i>State Environmental Quality Review Act</i>	35
<i>Incentive Zoning</i>	35
<i>Transfer of Development Rights</i>	36
<i>Tree Preservation</i>	36
<i>Freshwater Wetland Protection</i>	36
<i>The Acquisition Alternative</i>	37
<i>Methods and Examples of Acquiring Interests in Open Lands</i>	37
D. Smart Growth Applications.	38
<i>Smart Growth Processes</i>	39

Chapter 3

Planning and Land Use Regulation	43
A. Comprehensive Planning	44
<i>Definition</i>	44
<i>Purpose</i>	45
<i>When</i>	46
<i>Authority</i>	47
<i>Implementation</i>	47
<i>Illustration</i>	48
<i>Limitations and Concerns.</i>	48
<i>Statutes</i>	49
<i>Case Digest</i>	49
<i>References.</i>	51
B. Comprehensive Plan Diagnostic Checklist	51
<i>Basic Statutory Provisions</i>	52
<i>Public Participation in Plan Preparation.</i>	53
<i>Organization of the Comprehensive Plan.</i>	54
<i>The Planning Process</i>	55
<i>The Comprehensive Plan Diagnostic Checklist</i>	57
C. The Zoning Law and Its Amendment	62
<i>Definition</i>	62
<i>Purpose</i>	63
<i>When</i>	64
<i>Authority</i>	64
<i>Implementation</i>	65
<i>Illustration</i>	66
<i>Limitations and Concerns.</i>	67
<i>Statutes</i>	68
<i>Case Digest</i>	68
<i>References.</i>	70
D. Organizing Local Land Use Regulations.	70
<i>Definition</i>	70
<i>Purpose</i>	71
<i>When</i>	71
<i>Authority</i>	72
<i>Implementation</i>	72
<i>Limitations and Concerns.</i>	72
E. Home Rule Authority	83
<i>Definition</i>	83
<i>Purpose</i>	84
<i>When</i>	84

<i>Authority</i>	85
<i>Implementation</i>	85
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	86
<i>Statutes and Constitutional Provisions</i>	87
<i>Case Digest</i>	87
<i>References</i>	89
F. New York City Land Use Law	89
<i>Definition</i>	89
<i>Purpose</i>	89
<i>When</i>	90
<i>Authority</i>	90
<i>Implementation</i>	91
<i>Statutes</i>	93
<i>References</i>	94

Chapter 4

Standard Local Practice	95
A. Local Boards and Practices	96
<i>Definition</i>	96
<i>Purpose</i>	97
<i>When</i>	97
<i>Authority</i>	97
<i>Implementation</i>	98
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	99
<i>Statutes</i>	101
<i>Case Digest</i>	101
<i>References</i>	104
B. Variances	105
<i>Definition</i>	105
<i>Purpose</i>	105
<i>Authority</i>	105
<i>Implementation</i>	106
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	108
<i>Statutes</i>	108
<i>Case Digest</i>	109
<i>Reference</i>	111
C. Subdivision of Land	111
<i>Definition</i>	111
<i>Purpose</i>	112
<i>When</i>	113
<i>Authority</i>	113
<i>Implementation</i>	113
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	117
<i>Statutes</i>	118
<i>Case Digest</i>	119
<i>Reference</i>	122
D. Site Plan	122
<i>Definition</i>	122
<i>Purpose</i>	123
<i>When</i>	123
<i>Authority</i>	123
<i>Implementation</i>	123
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	125
<i>Statutes</i>	126

<i>Case Digest</i>	127
<i>References</i>	129
E. Special Use Permits	129
<i>Definition</i>	129
<i>Purpose</i>	129
<i>When</i>	130
<i>Authority</i>	130
<i>Implementation</i>	130
<i>Illustration</i>	131
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	132
<i>Statutes</i>	133
<i>Case Digest</i>	133
F. Building Permits and Certificates of Occupancy	136
<i>Definition</i>	136
<i>Purpose</i>	136
<i>When</i>	136
<i>Authority</i>	137
<i>Implementation</i>	137
<i>Illustrations</i>	138
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	139
<i>Statutes and Regulations.</i>	139
<i>Case Digest</i>	140
<i>References</i>	141
G. Permit Conditions.	141
<i>Definition</i>	141
<i>Purpose</i>	142
<i>When</i>	142
<i>Authority</i>	142
<i>Implementation</i>	143
<i>Illustrations</i>	143
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	144
<i>Statutes</i>	146
<i>Case Digest</i>	146
<i>Reference.</i>	147
H. Moratoria on Development	147
<i>Definition</i>	147
<i>Purpose</i>	148
<i>When</i>	148
<i>Authority</i>	148
<i>Implementation</i>	149
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	150
<i>Illustrations</i>	150
<i>Case Digest</i>	151
<i>Reference.</i>	153
I. Nonconforming Uses	153
<i>Definition</i>	153
<i>Purpose</i>	153
<i>When</i>	153
<i>Authority</i>	154
<i>Implementation</i>	154
<i>Illustrations</i>	154
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	157
<i>Case Digest</i>	158
J. Accessory Uses.	159

<i>Definition</i>	159
<i>Purpose</i>	160
<i>When</i>	160
<i>Authority</i>	160
<i>Implementation</i>	160
<i>Illustrations</i>	161
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	162
<i>Statutes</i>	162
<i>Case Digest</i>	163
<i>Reference.</i>	164
K. Permitting Accessory Apartments	164
<i>Definition</i>	164
<i>Purpose</i>	165
<i>When</i>	165
<i>Authority</i>	166
<i>Implementation</i>	166
<i>Other Options</i>	168
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	169
<i>Case Digest</i>	169
<i>Reference.</i>	170
L. Home Occupations.	170
<i>Definition</i>	170
<i>Purpose</i>	170
<i>When</i>	170
<i>Authority</i>	171
<i>Implementation</i>	171
<i>Illustrations</i>	171
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	172
<i>Statutes</i>	173
<i>Case Digest</i>	173
<i>Reference.</i>	174
M. Enforcement of Land Use Regulations.	174
<i>Definition</i>	174
<i>Purpose</i>	175
<i>When</i>	175
<i>Authority</i>	175
<i>Implementation</i>	176
<i>Illustrations</i>	177
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	178
<i>Statutes</i>	179
<i>Case Digest</i>	179
<i>References</i>	180
Chapter 5	
Environmental Review	183
A. Environmental Review Techniques.	184
<i>Definition</i>	184
<i>Purpose</i>	184
<i>When</i>	185
<i>Authority</i>	185
<i>Implementation</i>	185
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	186
<i>Statutes and Regulations.</i>	187
<i>Case Digest</i>	187

B. Advanced Environmental Review Techniques.	193
<i>Mitigation Conditions</i>	194
<i>Cumulative Impact Analysis</i>	195
<i>Generic Environmental Impact Statements</i>	197
<i>Critical Environmental Areas</i>	200
<i>Reference.</i>	205

Chapter 6

Balancing Development and Conservation	207
A. Overlay Zoning	209
<i>Definition</i>	209
<i>Purpose</i>	209
<i>When</i>	209
<i>Authority.</i>	210
<i>Implementation</i>	210
<i>Illustrations.</i>	211
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	212
<i>Statutes</i>	212
<i>Case Digest</i>	213
<i>Reference.</i>	213
B. Floating Zones.	213
<i>Definition</i>	213
<i>Purpose</i>	214
<i>When</i>	214
<i>Authority.</i>	214
<i>Implementation</i>	215
<i>Illustrations</i>	216
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	216
<i>Statutes</i>	217
<i>Case Digest</i>	217
<i>Reference.</i>	219
C. Cluster Development	219
<i>Definition</i>	219
<i>Purpose</i>	220
<i>When</i>	221
<i>Authority.</i>	221
<i>Implementation</i>	222
<i>Illustrations</i>	222
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	223
<i>Statutes</i>	223
<i>Case Digest</i>	224
<i>Reference.</i>	225
D. Planned Unit Development.	226
<i>Definition</i>	226
<i>Purpose</i>	226
<i>When</i>	226
<i>Authority.</i>	227
<i>Implementation</i>	227
<i>Illustration</i>	228
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	229
<i>Statutes</i>	229
<i>Case Digest</i>	230
<i>Reference.</i>	232
E. Incentive Zoning.	232

<i>Definition</i>	232
<i>Purpose</i>	233
<i>When</i>	233
<i>Authority</i>	233
<i>Implementation</i>	234
<i>Illustrations</i>	235
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	235
<i>Statutes and Regulations</i>	236
<i>Case Digest</i>	236
<i>Reference</i>	237
F. Transfer of Development Rights	237
<i>Definition</i>	237
<i>Purpose</i>	238
<i>When</i>	238
<i>Authority</i>	239
<i>Implementation</i>	239
<i>Illustrations</i>	240
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	241
<i>Alternative Approaches</i>	242
<i>Statutes</i>	243
<i>Case Digest</i>	243
<i>References</i>	243
G. Traditional Neighborhood Development	244
<i>Definition</i>	244
<i>Purpose</i>	244
<i>When</i>	245
<i>Authority</i>	245
<i>Implementation</i>	245
<i>Illustrations</i>	246
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	247
<i>Statutes</i>	248
<i>Case Digest</i>	248
<i>References</i>	249
H. Senior Citizen Housing Zoning	249
<i>Definition</i>	249
<i>Purpose</i>	250
<i>When</i>	250
<i>Authority</i>	251
<i>Implementation</i>	251
<i>Illustrations</i>	252
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	253
<i>Statutes</i>	254
<i>References</i>	254
I. Local Waterfront Management	254
<i>Definition</i>	254
<i>Purpose</i>	255
<i>When</i>	255
<i>Authority</i>	255
<i>Implementation</i>	256
<i>Illustrations</i>	256
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	257
<i>Statutes and Regulations</i>	258
<i>Case Digest</i>	258
<i>Reference</i>	258

Chapter 7

Intermunicipal Coordination 259

A. Intermunicipal Agreements 259

Definition 259

Purpose 260

When 260

Authority. 261

Implementation 261

Illustrations 262

Limitations and Concerns 263

Statutes and Rulings. 264

References 264

B. Local and County Agreements 264

Definition 264

Purpose 265

When 266

Authority. 266

Implementation 267

Illustrations 267

Limitations and Concerns 268

Statutes and Rulings. 268

References 268

C. Local Agreements With the Hudson River Greenway Council 269

Definition 269

Purpose 270

When 270

Authority. 271

Implementation 271

Illustrations 271

Limitations and Concerns 272

Statute 272

References 272

D. The Role of County Government in Land Use 272

Definition 272

Purpose 273

When 274

Authority. 274

Implementation 275

Illustration 277

Limitations and Concerns 278

Statutes, Regulations, and Rulings 278

Case Digest 280

References 280

Chapter 8

Resource Protection. 281

A. Local Natural Resource Protection. 281

Definition 281

Purpose 282

When 283

Authority. 283

Implementation 284

Limitations and Concerns 286

Constitutional Provisions, Statutes, and Rulings 286

<i>Case Digest</i>	288
<i>References</i>	290
B. Conservation Advisory Councils and Open Space Preservation	290
<i>Definition</i>	290
<i>Purpose</i>	291
<i>When</i>	291
<i>Authority</i>	291
<i>Implementation</i>	291
<i>Illustrations</i>	292
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	293
<i>Statutes and Rulings</i>	293
<i>Case Digest</i>	294
C. Conservation Easements and Land Trusts	295
<i>Definition</i>	295
<i>Purpose</i>	295
<i>When</i>	296
<i>Authority</i>	296
<i>Implementation</i>	296
<i>Illustrations</i>	297
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	299
<i>Statutes</i>	300
<i>Case Digest</i>	300
<i>References</i>	301
D. Watershed Protection/New York City Watershed Protection	301
<i>Definition</i>	301
<i>Purpose</i>	302
<i>When</i>	302
<i>Authority</i>	302
<i>Implementation</i>	305
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	305
<i>Statutes</i>	306
<i>Illustration-Regulations to Protect the New York City Watershed</i>	307
<i>References</i>	309
E. Protecting Aesthetic and Scenic Resources	309
<i>Definition</i>	309
<i>Purpose</i>	310
<i>When</i>	310
<i>Authority</i>	311
<i>Implementation</i>	311
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	313
<i>Constitutional Provisions, Statutes, and Rulings</i>	314
<i>Case Digest</i>	315
<i>References</i>	317
F. Regulating Signs and Outdoor Advertising	317
<i>Definition</i>	317
<i>Purpose</i>	317
<i>When</i>	318
<i>Authority</i>	318
<i>Implementation</i>	318
<i>Illustrations</i>	319
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	320
<i>Constitutional Provisions and Statutes</i>	321
<i>Case Digest</i>	321
<i>Reference</i>	323

G. Agricultural Land Protection	324
<i>Definition</i>	324
<i>Purpose</i>	324
<i>When</i>	325
<i>Authority</i>	325
<i>Implementation</i>	326
<i>Constitutional Provisions, Statutes, and Rulings</i>	328
<i>References</i>	328
H. Agricultural Zoning	329
<i>Definition</i>	329
<i>Purpose</i>	329
<i>When</i>	331
<i>Authority</i>	331
<i>Implementation</i>	331
<i>Illustration</i>	332
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	332
<i>Constitutional Provisions and Statutes</i>	333
<i>References</i>	333
I. Recreational Zoning	333
<i>Definition</i>	333
<i>Purpose</i>	334
<i>When</i>	334
<i>Authority</i>	335
<i>Implementation</i>	335
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	335
<i>Statute</i>	336
<i>Case Digest</i>	337
<i>References</i>	337
J. Freshwater Wetlands Regulation	338
<i>Definition</i>	338
<i>Purpose</i>	338
<i>When</i>	338
<i>Authority</i>	339
<i>Implementation</i>	340
<i>Illustrations</i>	341
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	343
<i>Statutes</i>	344
<i>Case Digest</i>	344
<i>Reference</i>	347
K. Open Space Acquisition	347
<i>Definition</i>	347
<i>Purpose</i>	347
<i>When</i>	348
<i>Authority</i>	348
<i>Implementation</i>	349
<i>Illustrations</i>	352
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	354
<i>Statutes</i>	354
<i>References</i>	354
Chapter 9	
Limitations on Local Land Use Authority	357
A. Affordable Housing and Exclusionary Zoning	358
<i>Definition</i>	358

<i>Purpose</i>	359
<i>When</i>	359
<i>Authority</i>	359
<i>Implementation</i>	360
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	361
<i>Statutes</i>	362
<i>Case Digest</i>	362
<i>References</i>	365
B. Regulation of Cellular Facilities	365
<i>Definition</i>	365
<i>Purpose</i>	366
<i>When</i>	366
<i>Authority</i>	366
<i>Implementation</i>	367
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	367
<i>Illustration</i>	368
<i>Statutes</i>	368
<i>Case Digest</i>	369
<i>Reference.</i>	371
C. Regulation of Adult Businesses.	371
<i>Definition</i>	371
<i>Purpose</i>	372
<i>When</i>	372
<i>Authority</i>	372
<i>Implementation</i>	372
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	373
<i>Illustrations</i>	374
<i>Constitutional and Statutory Citations</i>	375
<i>Case Digest</i>	376
<i>Reference.</i>	378
D. Group Homes, Disabilities, and Zoning.	378
<i>Definition</i>	378
<i>Purpose</i>	379
<i>When</i>	379
<i>Authority</i>	380
<i>Implementation</i>	380
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	381
<i>Illustrations</i>	382
<i>Statutes</i>	383
<i>Case Digest</i>	383
<i>Reference.</i>	386
E. Religion and Zoning	386
<i>Definition</i>	386
<i>Purpose</i>	387
<i>When</i>	387
<i>Authority</i>	387
<i>Implementation</i>	387
<i>Illustrations</i>	389
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	390
<i>Constitutional Provision</i>	390
<i>Case Digest</i>	391
<i>Reference.</i>	393

Chapter 10

Property Rights, Judicial Review, and Conflict Resolution 395

A. Challenges Brought Against Local Regulations 396

Definition 396

Authority 396

When 397

Avoiding Challenges to Local Land Use Regulations 397

Constitutional Provision 398

Case Digest 398

Reference 402

B. Vested Rights 402

Definition 402

Purpose 402

When 403

Authority 403

Implementation 403

Limitations and Concerns 403

Statutes 404

Case Digest 404

Reference 407

C. Regulatory Takings 408

Definition 408

Authority 408

When 409

Limitations and Concerns 412

Constitutional Provisions and Statutes 413

Case Digest 413

Reference 422

D. Judicial Review 422

Definition 422

Purpose 422

When 423

Authority and Implementation 433

Limitations and Concerns 424

Statutes 425

Case Digest 426

E. Using Mediation to Resolve Land Use Disputes 429

Definition 429

Purpose 430

When 430

Authority 430

Implementation 431

Illustration 431

Limitations and Concerns 432

Statutes 432

References 433

Model Local Land Use Mediation Law 433

F. Facilitation of Local Land Use Decisions 437

Definition 437

Purpose 437

When 438

Authority 438

Implementation 439

<i>Illustrations</i>	439
<i>Limitations and Concerns</i>	441
<i>Statutes and Regulations.</i>	441
<i>Case Digest</i>	441
Chapter 11	
Conclusion	443
Appendix A: Glossary of Terms and Phrases.	445
Appendix B: Table of Statutes	458
Appendix C: Table of Cases	462