FARMING FOR OUR FUTURE: THE SCIENCE, LAW, AND POLICY OF CLIMATE-NEUTRAL AGRICULTURE

Peter H. Lehner & Nathan A. Rosenberg

ENVIRONMENTAL LAW INSTITUTE
Washington, D.C.
# Table of Contents

About the Authors

Acknowledgments

Foreword

Chapter I. Introduction

Key Recommendations

Chapter II. The Stakeholders in Farm Policy

A. Farmers and the Farm Economy
   1. Transformations in the Farm Economy
   2. Overstatements in USDA Census of Agriculture Data
   3. A More Accurate Assessment of Farm Income and Wealth
   4. The Legacy of Discriminatory Agricultural Policy

B. New Constituencies
   1. Farms in the Rural Economy
   2. Non-White Farmers
   3. Rural Communities
   4. The Opportunity for Carbon Farming

Key Recommendations

Chapter III. The Climate Crisis and Agriculture

A. Climate Change’s Impact on Agriculture
B. Agriculture’s Contribution to Climate Change
C. Underestimates and Uncertainties ........................................... 47
   1. Underestimates ...................................................................... 49
   2. Uncertainties .......................................................................... 54
D. Agriculture’s Dual Opportunity .................................................. 58

Key Recommendations ..................................................................... 60

Chapter IV. Climate-Friendly Agricultural Systems and Practices .... 63
A. Agricultural Systems and Practices for Reducing
   Greenhouse Gas Emissions ............................................................ 66
   1. Cropland .................................................................................. 66
   2. Grazing Land ............................................................................ 88
   3. Animal Feeding Operations ..................................................... 95
   4. On-Farm Fuel Combustion and Electricity .............................. 102
B. Agriculture’s Maximum Contribution to Curbing
   Climate Change ............................................................................ 103

Key Recommendations ..................................................................... 107

Chapter V. Transforming Farm Policy Toward Climate-Neutral
Agriculture .......................................................................................... 111
A. Research, Extension, and Technical Assistance
   Programs ........................................................................................ 113
   1. Federal Research Programs .................................................... 113
   2. Public-Private Research Programs ........................................... 120
   3. State Research and Demonstration Programs ....................... 121
   4. Data Collection and Analysis ................................................. 123
   5. Extension Service ..................................................................... 129
   6. Technical Assistance ............................................................... 132
   7. Improving Coordination Among Research,
      Extension, and Technical Assistance Programs .................. 134
B. Public Subsidy and Conservation Programs ............................... 135
   1. Crop Insurance ......................................................................... 137
Table of Contents

2. Commodity Programs ............................................. 141
3. The Commodity Credit Corporation ..................... 143
4. Conservation Payments ........................................ 145
5. Conservation Easements ...................................... 154
6. Conservation Compliance Requirements .............. 156
7. Lending Programs ................................................ 160
8. Trade Policy ........................................................ 162
9. Transforming the Farm Safety Net Through Legislative Action ............................................. 163

C. Grazing Practices on Government Land ............... 166
D. Perennial Agriculture ............................................ 168
   1. Land Tenure ................................................... 172
   2. Research, Development, and Extension .......... 172
   3. Input, Distribution, and Marketing Infrastructure ... 174
   4. Farm Finance and Support ............................ 174
   5. Coordinating Efforts .................................... 176

E. Toward Climate-Neutral Agriculture .................... 176

Key Recommendations .............................................. 177

Chapter VI. Public Policy Pathways Beyond USDA for Advancing Climate-Neutral Agriculture ........ 181

A. Regulatory Options ............................................. 181
B. Tax Policy ........................................................ 193
C. Small Business Administration Lending Programs .... 197
D. Biogas Subsidies ............................................... 198
E. Greenhouse Gas Pricing ...................................... 201

Key Recommendations .............................................. 203

Chapter VII. Private- and Nonprofit-Sector Opportunities for Advancing Climate-Neutral Agriculture ....... 205

A. Research ......................................................... 205
B. Financing Options .......................................................... 206
C. Easements and Other Conservation Tools ...................... 207
D. Carbon Measurement Tools ........................................... 209
E. Carbon Markets ............................................................. 210
Key Recommendations ...................................................... 217
Chapter VIII. Off-Farm Food System Emission Reduction
Opportunities ...................................................................... 219
A. Upstream: Greenhouse Gas Emissions From Farm
   Inputs ............................................................................. 219
   1. Emissions From Fertilizer Production ...................... 220
   2. Fuel Economy Standards for Agricultural
      Equipment and Reduction of On-Farm
      Energy Use .................................................................. 222
B. Downstream: Emissions From Food Processing,
   Packaging, Marketing, and Waste ................................. 223
   1. Processing, Packaging, Distribution, and
      Marketing Emissions .............................................. 224
   2. Landfill Waste Emissions ......................................... 224
Key Recommendations ...................................................... 228
Chapter IX. Changing Consumption Patterns ...................... 229
A. Dietary Guidelines ....................................................... 229
B. Federal Procurement and Food Assistance ...................... 232
C. Private-Sector Strategies .............................................. 235
   1. Certification Systems and Supply Chain
      Commitments ....................................................... 235
   2. Plant-Forward Alternatives ................................. 237
Key Recommendations ...................................................... 239
Chapter X. Conclusion ...................................................... 241
Index .................................................................................. 243
About the Authors

Peter H. Lehner is Managing Attorney of the Sustainable Food & Farming (SFF) Program at Earthjustice, the country’s largest nonprofit public interest environmental law organization. The SFF Program deploys strategies to promote a more just, environmentally sound, and climate-resilient agricultural system and to reduce the health, environmental, and climate harms from production of our food. From 2007–2015, Lehner was the Executive Director of the Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC) and the NRDC Action Fund. There, he grew the organization and particularly the climate change and clean energy programs, opened several new offices and programs, and expanded the food system work. From 1999-2006, he served as Chief of the Environmental Protection Bureau of the New York State Attorney General’s office, supervising all environmental litigation by and against the state. Earlier, Lehner started and led the Environmental Prosecution Unit at the New York City Law Department. Lehner holds an A.B. in Philosophy and Mathematics from Harvard College and is an honors graduate of Columbia University Law School, where he now teaches a class on agriculture and environmental law. Lehner also helps manage two family farms. He is on several NGO boards and has been honored with numerous awards by EPA and many environmental groups.

Nathan A. Rosenberg is a visiting scholar at the Food Law and Policy Clinic at Harvard Law School and an attorney consulting for Earthjustice. Nathan has taught agricultural law and policy at the University of Iowa College of Law, the University of Arkansas School of Law, and the New York University Steinhardt School of Culture, Education, and Human Development. He has also worked as a legal fellow for the Natural Resources Defense Council and as director of the Delta Directions Consortium.
Acknowledgments

Several years ago, Professors John Dernbach and Michael Gerrard asked us to write the agriculture chapter for a book they were editing, *Legal Pathways to Deep Decarbonization in the United States* (ELI Press 2019). Because prior Deep Decarbonization Pathways Project reports did not address the U.S. agriculture sector in depth, our chapter outlined both the technologies and practices that could be implemented to reduce the climate change impact of agriculture, and the legal options to accelerate their adoption. After the *Legal Pathways* book was released, the publisher, the Environmental Law Institute, noted that agriculture’s impact on climate change was a rich but largely under-addressed field, and asked us to update and expand the chapter into a stand-alone book. This book is the result of that effort.

We would like to extend our deepest gratitude to John Dernbach and Michael Gerrard for inviting us to contribute to *Legal Pathways* and for their many ideas and insightful edits and comments. We also thank the participants of the Legal Pathways to Deep Decarbonization workshop at Columbia Law School for their suggestions. And through the writing of both the chapter and the book (as well as an intermediate article), our sharp-eyed editor at ELI, Rachel Jean-Baptiste, has been attentive, helpful, and full of good ideas.

We are very grateful to all of our Earthjustice colleagues who have provided tremendous input to this book, the prior article, and the many documents that we have relied on. They have carefully reviewed our scientific and legal statements and helped shape our policy proposals. We particularly thank Alexis Andiman, Carrie Apfel, Claire Huang, Ranjani Prabhakar, Mustafa Saifuddin, and Tyler Smith, as well as Sorangel Liriano, Greg Loarie, Mekela Panditharatne, Surbhi Sarang, Dawa Sherpa, and Patrice Simms.

We are also very grateful to Earthjustice for providing us time and support so we could share what we’ve learned about this critical topic.

We wish to thank Ben Anderson, Andrew Bowman, Michael Castellano, Adam Chambers, Alyssa Charney, Craig Cox, Marcia DeLonge, Graham Downey, Thomas Driscoll, Mark Easter, William Eubanks, Scott Faber, Jonathan Gelbard, Elizabeth Hanson, Claire Horan, Karen Hudson, Wendy Jacobs, Barbara Jones, Allen Olson, Keith Paustian, Margot Pollans, Kiley Reid, Charles Rosenberg, Susan Rosenberg, Susan Schneider, Edward Stroh-
behn, Bryce Stucki, Margaret Torn, and Jim Williams, for voluntarily taking
the time to review our drafts of this book and earlier articles and documents
that formed its foundation. We are grateful for their many helpful comments.

Many thanks to Becca Bartholomew, Sherri Dugger, and Sarah Rodman-
Alvarez whose earlier research helped shape these recommendations. Their
interviews for us with over 100 sustainable farmers, advocates, and com-
munity leaders contained a wealth of expertise and experience that deeply
enriched the scientific and legal analyses. We are grateful also for the gener-
osity of those interviewed for their time, trust, and openness.

We are indebted to the participants and organizers of the Policy Path-
ways to Perennial Agriculture seminar, hosted by the Radcliffe Institute for
Advanced Study and the Harvard Law School Food Law and Policy Clinic,
for helping us better understand the challenges and opportunities presented
by perennial systems. We are especially grateful to Emily Broad Leib, Fred
Lutzi, Sarah Lovell, Emma Scott, and Eric Toensmeier for their feedback and
suggestions. We also thank Lingxi Chenyang, Andrew Currie, and Hannah
Darin for generously sharing their research on agroforestry and farm policy,
which greatly informed our understanding of perennial agriculture.

We are also deeply indebted to the many advocates and allies in the envi-
ronmental and sustainable agriculture movements whose insights have made
our own work possible. There are far too many to name but we would be
remiss if we failed to mention Carlos Borgonovo, Stephanie Cappa, Alyssa
Charney, Callie Eideberg, Madeleine Foote, Aviva Glaser, Elizabeth Hen-
derson, Ferd Hoefner, Greg Horner, Mark Izeman, Allison Johnson, Eric
Kamrath, Michael Lavender, Claire O’Connor, Erik Olson, Mary Pfaffko,
Diego Robelo, Virginia Ruiz, and Seth Watkins.

And finally, and most important, we thank the thousands of researchers,
farmers, and farmworkers who have worked for years to develop, implement,
and refine the practices we discuss. They have set the stage for a nationwide
effort to transform agriculture into a climate solution.
Foreword

In this book, we examine the agricultural strategies, practices, and technologies that can make agriculture in the United States climate-neutral or better, and thus help to curb climate change. Agriculture both contributes to climate change and is severely affected by the more frequent extreme weather, increased pests and heat, and other challenges produced by it. Not only does our food security depend on an agricultural system that can continue and thrive in changed conditions, but our overall security depends on limiting climate change. And while agricultural greenhouse gas emissions may seem modest compared with those from the electricity, transportation, or industrial sectors, agriculture's contribution to climate change is substantial (far more than generally realized) and we will not be able to achieve our mitigation goals unless agricultural emissions sharply decline. Fortunately, agriculture can be a major part of the climate solution, and in the process improve rural communities and the lives of those who work on farms and ranches.

Many visionary farmers, researchers, and advocates have already started down this path. Here, we summarize the many agricultural practices that have been demonstrated to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and increase carbon sequestration in soil, including cover cropping, more varied crop rotations, agroforestry and silvopasture (adding trees into cropping or grazing systems), perennial crops, prescribed rotational grazing, dry manure management, and others. Of course, there are nuances in impact depending on region, climate, and how farmers implement these practices—and there are often conflicting scientific studies and over-simplified advocacy claims—yet it is clear that agriculture itself can become climate-neutral without offsets. Numerous scientific studies as well as the actual experience of many farmers (including one of the authors) have shown that these practices also reduce soil erosion and water pollution—a significant challenge in many parts of the country—and increase soil fertility and productivity, and thus often profitability. They also help farms and ranches build climate resiliency and better withstand the increased stresses that climate change is already bringing, such as floods, droughts, heat waves, pests, and more.
Despite these proven benefits, only a small portion of farmers in the United States implement these practices on only a small fraction of U.S. agricultural land. It is clear that policy change is needed in order to accelerate their adoption. The heart of this book examines policy pathways to accelerate adoption of climate-friendly practices by amending existing federal and state legal regimes and enacting new ones. We recommend improving public agricultural research, development, and technical assistance efforts, especially for climate-friendly practices; reforming federal subsidy and conservation programs; and revising agricultural lending programs, trade policy, grazing practices on government land, programs for perennial agriculture, regulatory strategies, tax policy, biogas subsidies, and greenhouse gas pricing. We also describe how the private and philanthropic sectors can stimulate carbon farming. Moreover, because agriculture is the foundation of our national food system, we also look to upstream and downstream strategies to move toward climate-neutrality, including reducing emissions that stem from production of farm inputs and on-farm energy and from food processing, distribution, consumption, and waste. We also discuss the potential of encouraging consumption of climate-friendly foods through national dietary guidelines, procurement at all levels of government, and private-sector initiatives such as certification schemes and healthier menu options.

Most people think about food often; our food choices both shape and reflect our values and our communities. More than 20 million people work in agriculture and the food system, some in capacities they love and many in jobs with low pay, few protections, and difficult working conditions. We intend this book to help decisionmakers, farmers, consumers, and others take advantage of this opportunity to transform such a critical and central part of people’s lives into a solution for climate change. And while there are many aspects of farm policy that this short book does not and cannot address, we hope that the demonstration of the enormous beneficial potential impact of the policy changes we do recommend will inspire and lead to additional policy exploration. After all, we are what we eat and we reap what we sow.