# Table of Contents

Foreword ................................................................................................................................. xi

About the Authors .................................................................................................................... xiii

Chapter 1 — Introduction ......................................................................................................... 1
  I. Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1
     A. Antecedents to the CWA .............................................................................................. 2
     B. The CWA Structure ...................................................................................................... 3
     C. Who Regulates Federally Protected Wetlands? ........................................................... 4
     D. No Net Loss National Policy ....................................................................................... 7
     E. Other Federal Wetland Laws and Programs ................................................................. 8
  II. Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 9

Chapter 2 — What Wetlands Are Regulated? Jurisdiction of the §404 Program .................. 11
  I. CWA Wetlands and Waters of the United States .............................................................. 11
  II. Physical Definition of Wetlands and Waters of the United States ............................... 13
     A. Identifying Wetlands Using the 1987 Corps Delineation Manual and the Regional Supplements .......................................................................................................................... 13
  III. Process for Determining Wetlands Jurisdiction ............................................................. 17
     A. EPA/Corps Jurisdictional Authority .......................................................................... 17
     B. CWA Jurisdictional Determinations ........................................................................... 18
     C. Legal Issues of CWA Jurisdiction .............................................................................. 20
     D. Solid Waste Agency of Northern Cook County v. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (SWANCC) ............................................................................................................................... 30
  IV. Conclusion to Jurisdiction .............................................................................................. 47

Chapter 3 — Can Wetland Property Be Developed? Regulated Activities and Statutory Exemptions .................................................................................................................. 49
  I. What Activities in Wetlands Are Regulated? .................................................................... 49
     A. Pertinent Definitions ..................................................................................................... 49
     B. Examples of Regulated Activities ............................................................................... 51
     C. Summary of Regulated Activities ............................................................................... 68
  II. Permit Exemptions .......................................................................................................... 69
     A. Statutory Exemptions ................................................................................................... 69
     B. The Regulations for §404 (Exemptions) ..................................................................... 71
     C. Specific Exemptions ..................................................................................................... 72
     D. Recapture Provision .................................................................................................... 78
     E. Federal Projects .......................................................................................................... 78
     F. Summary of Exemptions .............................................................................................. 81
Table of Contents

B. Administrative Penalty Orders ................................................................. 156
C. Judicial Review of Administrative Compliance and Penalty Orders ........ 160

III. Civil Judicial Enforcement ................................................................. 163
    A. General Standards ........................................................................... 163
    B. Defenses .......................................................................................... 164
    C. Available Injunctive Remedies ......................................................... 167

IV. Civil Penalties ................................................................................ 168
    A. Civil Penalty Standards .................................................................... 168
    B. Federal Settlement Policy ................................................................. 171

V. Criminal Enforcement ..................................................................... 172

VI. Citizen Enforcement ....................................................................... 174
    A. Basic Requirements ......................................................................... 174
    B. Preclusion of a Citizen Suit .............................................................. 176
    C. No Citizen Actions for Violation of Permit Terms ....................... 178
    D. No Mandatory-Duty Actions for Enforcement ............................ 179
    E. Federal Intervention in Citizen Suits .............................................. 180
    F. Citizen Suit Statute of Limitations ............................................... 180

VII. Summary of Enforcement ............................................................. 181

Chapter 7 — State Authorities ............................................................... 183

I. State Authority for §404 Permitting .................................................. 183
    A. State Program Authorization .......................................................... 184
    B. State Programmatic General Permits .............................................. 185
    C. Special State Program: The Alaska Wetlands Initiative ................ 186

II. Preservation of Other State Powers .................................................. 186

III. Examples of State Wetland Laws ..................................................... 187
    Alabama ............................................................................................... 187
    Alaska ................................................................................................. 188
    Arizona ............................................................................................... 188
    Arkansas .............................................................................................. 188
    California ........................................................................................... 188
    Colorado ............................................................................................. 189
    Connecticut ......................................................................................... 189
    Delaware ............................................................................................. 189
    District of Columbia ............................................................................. 190
    Florida ................................................................................................. 190
    Georgia ............................................................................................... 190
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idaho</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kentucky</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisiana</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maine</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryland</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massachusetts</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnesota</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mississippi</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montana</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nebraska</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nevada</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Hampshire</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Carolina</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Dakota</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Carolina</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Dakota</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennessee</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vermont</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

Washington.............................................................................................................197
West Virginia........................................................................................................197
Wisconsin..................................................................................................................198
Wyoming..................................................................................................................198

IV. Summary of State Programs...........................................................................198

Chapter 8 — Wetlands and CWA Programs Other Than §404.................................199
I. Wetlands and Water Quality Standards..............................................................199
II. Wetlands and §401 State Certification...............................................................200
III. Wetlands and Nonpoint Source Pollution.......................................................201
IV. Wetlands and Watersheds..............................................................................203
V. Conclusion.........................................................................................................205

Chapter 9 — Other Federal Wetlands Laws and Programs ..................................207
I. U.S. Department of the Interior Programs..........................................................207
   A. Fish and Wildlife Service Resources..............................................................207
   B. National Wildlife Refuge System Administration Act of 1966...............208
   C. Fish and Wildlife Coordination Act..............................................................210
   D. Migratory Bird Conservation Act.................................................................210
   E. Migratory Bird Hunting and Conservation Stamp Act (Duck Stamp Act)....211
   F. Land and Water Conservation Fund Act of 1965.........................................211
   G. Emergency Wetlands Resources Act of 1986.............................................212
   H. North American Wetlands Conservation Act of 1989 (Ramsar Convention)........................................................................................................212
   I. Interior Department Mitigation Strategy.......................................................213
II. U.S. Department of Agriculture Programs.........................................................213
   A. The Swampbuster Program...........................................................................214
   B. Sodbuster......................................................................................................215
   C. Conservation Reserve Program (CRP)........................................................215
III. Wetlands Reserve Program (WRP)..................................................................216
   A. Other Programs ..........................................................................................216
   B. Cases Involving the Agricultural Wetland Programs....................................217
IV. Coastal Wetlands Programs.............................................................................218
   A. Coastal Zone Management Act (CZMA)......................................................218
   B. Coastal Barriers Resources Act.....................................................................219
   C. Coastal Wetlands Planning, Protection, and Restoration.........................220
   D. National Coastal Monitoring Program.........................................................221
Chapter 10 — Practical Tips and Pitfalls in Wetlands Law

I. Identifying Waters of the United States
   A. The Moving Goal Posts of Delineation
   B. Legal Jurisdiction
   C. Courts Make Bad Ecologists Establishing Jurisdictional Standards

II. Navigating the Permit Process
   A. Joint Permit Applications
   B. Comment on Permit Applications
   C. Some Emerging Environmental Issues
   D. Interagency Coordination

III. Practical Experience With Preliminary JDs and Administrative Appeals
   A. Preliminary JDs
   B. Administrative Appeals

IV. Endangered Species and §404

V. Where to Find More Guidance
   A. Review Historic Sources of Interpretation and Guidance

VI. Elevation and Review of Issues by Applicants
   A. Corps Structure for Elevation From Regulatory Through DE Through Division and Headquarters

VII. Enforcement Actions—Understanding and Settling

VIII. Flooding, Floodplains, and Climate Change Adaptation

IX. Sources of Assistance for Wetland Enhancements

X. Conclusion
## Appendices

| A | Clean Water Act Jurisdiction Following the U.S. Supreme Court’s Decision in *Rapanos v. United States* and *Carabell v. United States* (Dec. 2, 2008) | 249 |
| B | Memorandum for Commander, Major Subordinate Commands and District Commands (Jan. 28, 2008) | 265 |
| C | Memorandum for Director of Civil Works and U.S. EPA Regional Administrators (June 5, 2008) | 269 |
| D | Memorandum of Agreement Among the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, and the Natural Resources Conservation Service for the Purpose of Transferring Responsibility for Updating and Maintaining the National List of Vascular Plant Species That Occur in Wetlands (Dec. 7, 2006) | 279 |
| E | Statutory and Regulatory Citations | 285 |
| F | U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Jurisdictional Determination (JD) Form Instructional Guidebook | 515 |
| H | Proposed “Definition of ‘Waters of the United States’ Under the Clean Water Act” | 689 |
| I | Letter From Dr. David T. Allen, Chair, Science Advisory Board (SAB), to Gina McCarthy, Administrator, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, on SAB Consideration of the Adequacy of the Scientific and Technical Basis of EPA’s Proposed Rule Titled “Definition of Waters of the United States Under the Clean Water Act” (Sept. 30, 2014) | 693 |
| J | List of Case Citations | 705 |

ELR’s Wetlands Deskbook

Few areas of environmental law have invited as much controversy and litigation as federal wetlands law. And, few areas are as important to the health of our ecosystems and the protection of drinking water sources. Although there is no single wetlands statute, a number of federal and state statutes and programs address protection and use of wetlands. Federal statutes that impact water pollution, agricultural production, fish and wildlife habitat, and certain federal benefit programs all touch on wetlands. This complicated legal structure results in an array of definitions, prohibitions, and policies applicable to activities that affect wetlands. All of this has created significant challenges for the regulatory agencies charged with overseeing the nation’s wetlands and generated a significant number of U.S. Supreme Court cases, ranging from *U.S. v. Riverside Bayview Homes* to *Solid Waste Agency of Northern Cook County (SWANCC) v. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers* through *Rapanos v. United States* and then to *Sackett v. EPA*.

Wetlands law must consider the very delicate balance of private land rights, since wetlands often occur on privately owned land, versus the considerable public interest in preserving and protecting the ecological benefits of wetlands. This balance is reflected in laws and policies that set up procedural safeguards, delineation guidance, and mitigation requirements in some cases. The balance can also be seen in the various federal wetlands acquisition programs and was at the heart of the recent Supreme Court decision *Koontz v. St. Johns River Water Management District*, which addressed regulatory takings. In short, federal laws and their implementation by federal and state agencies demand careful study and understanding by all practitioners in this important area.

The Wetlands Deskbook is part of ELI’s comprehensive program to protect wetlands, one of our most valuable natural resources. ELI’s Wetlands Program provides professionals and the public with timely, balanced information on wetlands law, policy, science, and management in order to prevent wetlands loss and result in a net gain of wetlands across the United States. The Wetlands Program has three major areas of focus: education and outreach to promote the best in wetlands protection; convening experts and stakeholders; and research and policy analysis on cutting-edge issues, particularly mitigation banking. This Deskbook is an example of the program at work, as we seek to make wetlands law more accessible to practitioners.

The Wetlands Deskbook is part of ELI’s Deskbook series, which combines the invaluable experience of the top practitioners in the field with the encyclopedic coverage and keen insight provided by the staff of the Environmental Law Reporter. Deskbooks provide practicing attorneys, students, environmental professionals, and government officials an “at-the-fingertips” resource for accessing and understanding environmental law. The series covers climate change, endangered species, NEPA, TSCA, FIFRA, and many other topics by combining in-depth analysis of the topic with necessary reference materials, such as regulations, guidance documents, and forms.

The Deskbooks are natural partners to ELI’s flagship resource, the Environmental Law Reporter. ELR is an attorney-edited gateway to researching and understanding environmental law and policy, with coverage since 1971 available online in an easily searchable format. ELR couples thousands of insightful articles on environmental law and policy with the most important updates, decisions, statutes, regulations, and agency documents and a cumulative index and bibliography to help you navigate this highly complex area of law. More information about the Deskbooks, ELR, and ELI’s Wetlands Program is available at www.eli.org.

The Wetlands Deskbook was authored by Peggy Strand and Lowell Rothschild, both experts in this important area. The Wetlands Deskbook has become known as one of the most authoritative sources on this area of law due to the insight and care Peggy and Lowell have put into this work over many years. The significant reworking of the fourth edition reflects major changes in the area of law and the authors’ careful rethinking of how best to present this to readers. We are very grateful to them for their hard work and dedication in bringing the Deskbook into being. ELR staff also deserves our sincerest thanks for their effort and skill in helping us to create this valuable resource.
The Environmental Law Institute makes law work for people, places, and the planet. With its nonpartisan, independent approach, ELI promotes solutions to tough environmental problems. The Institute’s unparalleled research and highly respected publications inform the public debate and build the institutions needed to advance sustainable development. We hope the *Wetlands Deskbook* provides valuable insight into this vital area of environmental law and regulation.

John C. Cruden  
President, ELI
About the Authors

Margaret “Peggy” Strand is a partner at Venable, LLP in Washington, D.C. Ms. Strand has substantial experience advising on the regulatory requirements of federal and state law, including wetlands, natural resources, protected species, climate change, and pollution control. She was Chief of the Environmental Defense Section in the U.S. Justice Department, Environmental and Natural Resources Division, from 1984 to 1991, and served as a Justice Department trial attorney and supervisor since 1976. Ms. Strand is active with the National Academy of Sciences, as she currently chairs the Environmental Law Committee of the Transportation Research Board and has served on the Academy’s Board on Environmental Studies and Toxicology. She has also participated in various Academy study committees evaluating wetlands and other environmental topics.

She is past chair of the American Bar Association’s Water Quality and Wetlands Committee, Section on Environment, Energy, and Resources Law (SEER) and serves on the ALI-ABA Advisory Committee on Environmental Law. She is a regular chair and speaker on wetlands and species protection topics for ALI-ABA and other bar organizations. She has also served on the board of directors of the Environmental Law Institute, the Editorial Board of the Environmental Law Reporter, and the Advisory Board for the National Wetlands Newsletter.

Lowell Rothschild, Senior Counsel at Bracewell & Giuliani LLP, is an environmental litigator focusing on natural resource issues such as wetlands, endangered species, and environmental review (NEPA). For over 20 years, he has represented private, public, governmental, and quasi-governmental clients working in the oil and gas, natural resource extraction, and infrastructure development sectors in obtaining and defending permits and responding to allegations of legal noncompliance, through both internal investigations and litigation.

Mr. Rothschild’s practice has included cases before the U.S. Supreme Court, multiple federal circuit and district courts, and U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and U.S. Department of the Interior administrative tribunals. He is a member of the Trade and Environmental Policy Advisory Committee to the U.S. Trade Representative and was formerly the primary in-house environmental counsel for the world’s largest integrated phosphate and potash (fertilizer) supplier.