About the Authors

Valerie Ann Lee is the president of Environment International Limited, an environmental consulting firm, and the principal of the law firm Acadia Law PLLC; both are headquartered in Seattle, Washington. For over 25 years, she has assisted state, federal, tribal, and private clients in natural resource claims and damage assessments and has achieved positive results cost-effectively. She has assisted clients in conducting streamlined natural resource damage assessments (NRDAs) and helped them grapple with coordination of response actions and NRDAs under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA). In both her consulting and legal practices, Ms. Lee has provided assistance to clients in environmental matters including those involving compliance with natural resource, environmental, and land-use planning laws, brownfields redevelopment, and litigation of natural resource damage claims. Ms. Lee formerly was a trial attorney for the U.S. Department of Justice’s Environment Enforcement Section, where she filed and litigated some of the first natural resource damage cases and achieved success in reaching settlements that led to innovative and successful restoration projects. While at the Department of Justice, Ms. Lee also litigated enforcement cases for federal agencies under federal statutes, including those discussed in this deskbook. Recognized for her expertise, she has testified before the U.S. Congress, state governors, and tribal councils. She has published articles on climate change, brownfields redevelopment, the Endangered Species Act, and alternative dispute resolution. Ms. Lee received a J.D. from the Yale Law School, an M.S. in civil engineering from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, and a B.S., magna cum laude, in biology from Bates College. She can be reached via e-mail at valerie.lee@eiltd.net and valerie.lee@acadialaw.com.

P.J. Bridgen is an officer of Environment International Limited and an expert in risk assessment, risk communication, environmental management, natural resource damage assessments (NRDAs), cost allocations under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act, and environmental management systems (EMS). Dr. Bridgen has provided advice to private parties and governments, including tribal governments, in connection with NRDAs across the United States, participating in both litigation and successful, cost-effective collaborative assessments. Dr. Bridgen is certified as a lead auditor for International Organization for Standardization 14001 EMS and was one of the first experts in the United States to be so designated. Dr. Bridgen’s expertise in environmental matters has been recognized nationally. Appointed by the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Dr. Bridgen served on the Technology and Innovation Committee, a part of the National Advisory Council on Environmental Policy and Technology, and, by Cabinet-level appointment, served on the National Biotechnology Policy Board that advises the president and the U.S. Congress. Dr. Bridgen has testified before Congress and served as a liaison to the White House on environmental issues as an executive director of a trade organization. Dr. Bridgen received a Ph.D. in biochemistry from Leicester in England, was a postdoctoral fellow and research associate at the National Institutes of Health and at Cambridge University, and received an M.B.A. with distinction from the Wharton School and a B.Sc. with honors in biochemistry from Leeds in England. Bridgen has contributed to the literature on brownfields redevelopment and EMS.

Environment International Ltd. is a consulting firm with headquarters in Seattle, Washington. EI is an interdisciplinary team of experienced environmental managers, lawyers, engineers, scientists, and policy analysts who specialize in natural resource damage assessments, risk assessment, site investigation, sustainable development, and alternative dispute resolution of environmental matters. EI’s clients include private parties and governments. The firm’s website can be found at www.eiltd.net.

Acadia Law PLLC, is a Seattle-based law firm focusing on environmental law, litigation, and dispute resolution services. Acadia Law attorneys provide representation in natural resource damage assessment matters and have a depth of experience providing advice under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act. Acadia Law also provides dispute resolution services in connection with environmental and commercial disputes. Visit the firm’s website at www.acadialaw.com.
Acknowledgments

The authors would like to acknowledge the staff of Environment International Ltd. (EI), who provided assistance in the preparation of this deskbook. In particular, Hana Rubin contributed to the restoration chapter and provided research support. Rubin also was EI’s outstanding patient in-house editor for the entire deskbook. Aron Borok provided support for the analysis of economic tools in natural resource damage assessment (NRDA) and graphic support to help explain concepts in injury determination and damage valuation. Stephani Ayers assisted in the legal analysis of the Marine Protection, Research, and Sanctuaries Act (MPRSA) and the National Park System Resources Protection Act (NPSRPA). EI’s resident historian and congressional watchdog, Dan O’Brien, provided valuable information that contributed to an understanding of the precipitating events that motivated Congress to enact the statutes discussed.

For this second edition, we wish to thank Marcus Lee for his contribution and his assistance in updating case law, regulations, and policy. Jesse Sayles provided specific content on ecological and human-environment sciences and practices. The assistance of these staff members contributed greatly to the development of this updated edition.

We caution the reader, however, that the authors take full responsibility for the content and tenor of the deskbook. Any omission or lack of insight is ours alone and notwithstanding the thoughtful comments of all those who provided review and assistance. We hope that the reader finds this deskbook useful.
Dedication

To my mother, who knee-deep in tide pools taught me at an early age love of the environment and all things scientific.

To my father, who told me that science is interesting but showed me that law and politics often drive decisions.

To Gary, Harry, and Steve, scientists with a vision, who made good science part and parcel of environmental litigation. To Mike and Jen, who implemented their vision and made it all worth the while.

~ VAL

To Dorothy and Arthur Beresford, my parents, who helped me become who I am today.

~ PJB
# Table of Contents

**Introduction** .......................................................................................................................... xvii

**Chapter 1 — Natural Resource Damage Assessment Concepts and Players** ......................... 1

1.1 *Introduction* ........................................................................................................................ 1

1.2 *An Overview of Natural Resource Damage Assessment Concepts* ................................. 1

1.2.1 *Injury and Damage* ........................................................................................................... 1

1.2.2 *Compensatory Focus Through Restoration* .................................................................... 1

1.2.3 *Natural Resource Damage Assessment Elements* .......................................................... 2

1.2.4 *Assessment Costs* ............................................................................................................. 3

1.3 *Trustees and Their Role in Damage Assessments* ............................................................... 3

1.3.1 *Federal Trustees* ............................................................................................................. 4

1.3.2 *State Trustees* .................................................................................................................. 4

1.3.3 *Tribal Trustees* ................................................................................................................. 4

1.3.4 *Foreign Natural Resource Trustees* ................................................................................ 5

1.4 *Cooperative Assessments* .................................................................................................... 5

**Chapter 2 — Historical Context for Natural Resource Damage Assessment** ..................... 7

2.1 *Introduction* ........................................................................................................................ 7

2.2 *Statutory Evolution* .............................................................................................................. 8

2.2.1 *The Trans-Alaska Pipeline Authorization Act* ............................................................... 8

2.2.2 *The Deepwater Port Act of 1974* .................................................................................. 9

2.2.3 *1977 Amendments to the Clean Water Act—Inclusion of State Trustees as in the Natural Resource Damage Enforcement Model* ............... 10


2.2.5 *1988 Amendments, the Marine Protection, Research, and Sanctuaries Act* ............... 11

2.2.6 *The National Park System Resource Protection Act* ..................................................... 11

2.2.7 *Coming Full Circle, the Oil Pollution Act of 1990* ......................................................... 11

2.3 *The Common Body of Natural Resource Damage Law and Science* ................................. 12

**Chapter 3 — Character of the Event and Coverage of Federal Authorities** ...................... 13

3.1 *Agent Causing Injury* .......................................................................................................... 13

3.2 *Location of the Event or Incident* ....................................................................................... 14

3.3 *Resources Potentially Affected and Trustees* ................................................................... 15

3.4 *Natural Resource Damage Assessment Trustees* .............................................................. 16

3.5 *Time Frame of the Event or Injury* .................................................................................... 18
Chapter 4 — The Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Overview of Statutory Framework</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The Superfund</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 The National Priorities List</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Response Actions</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Natural Resource Damages</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Liability Framework</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Summary</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Standard of Liability</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Type and Character of Event Triggering Liability</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 Natural Resource Injuries “Resulting From” Releases</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5 Presumptions in Litigation</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.6 Responsible Parties</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.7 Those That Just Look Like Responsible Parties</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.8 Defenses</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.9 Exceptions and Limitations to Liability</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Considerations in Natural Resource Damage Litigation</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 Statute of Limitations</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2 Right to Jury Trial and Record Review</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3 Preemption of State Law</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.4 Claims Brought by Tribes on Behalf of Tribal Members: Public Versus Private Losses in Indian Country</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.5 Indispensable Parties</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Amendments of 2002 Applying to Response Cost Liability</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.1 De Micromis Exemption</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.2 Municipal Solid Waste Exemption</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Natural Resource Damages for Climate Change?</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 5 — The Oil Pollution Act

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Statutory Framework and Liability</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Type and Location of Discharge Triggering OPA Liability</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Standard of Liability and Responsible Parties</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3 Defenses and Limitations to Liability</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Recoverable Costs and Damages</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Removal Costs</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3.2 Compensatory Damages .......................................................... 66
5.3.3 Natural Resource Damages ..................................................... 67

5.4 Considerations in Claims .......................................................... 69
5.4.1 Notice and Election of Remedies ........................................... 69
5.4.2 Jurisdiction .......................................................................... 70
5.4.3 Statute of Limitations .......................................................... 71
5.4.4 Presumptions in Litigation .................................................... 71
5.4.5 Right to Jury Trial ............................................................... 71
5.4.6 Settlements ........................................................................ 72
5.4.7 Preemption of State Law ...................................................... 72

5.5 Claims Against the Fund .......................................................... 73
5.5.1 The Fund ........................................................................... 73
5.5.2 Claimants .......................................................................... 73
5.5.3 Categories of Compensable Costs and Damages .................. 73
5.5.4 Procedures for Making Claims Against the Fund ............... 74

Chapter 6 — The Clean Water Act .................................................. 77
6.1 Introduction ............................................................................ 77
6.2 Statutory Framework for Natural Resource Damages ............... 78
6.2.1 Summary .......................................................................... 78
6.2.2 Type and Location of Action Triggering CWA Liability ........ 78
6.2.3 Standard of Liability and Responsible Parties ..................... 80
6.2.4 Defenses, Exclusions, and Limitations to Liability ............... 81
6.3 Recoverable Costs and Damages .............................................. 83
6.3.1 Removal Costs .................................................................. 83
6.3.2 Natural Resource Damages ............................................... 84
6.3.3 Gulf Coast Restoration Fund ............................................. 84
6.4 Considerations in Claims ....................................................... 85
6.4.1 Jurisdiction ....................................................................... 85
6.4.2 Statute of Limitations ........................................................ 85
6.4.3 Ripeness .......................................................................... 85
6.4.4 Presumptions in Litigation ................................................ 86

Chapter 7 — The Marine Protection, Research, and Sanctuaries Act .... 87
7.1 Introduction ............................................................................ 87
7.2 Overview of Areas Under the Protection of MPRSA ................ 87
7.3 Statutory Framework .............................................................. 90
7.4 Natural Resource Damage Liability ......................................... 91
| 10.6.2 | *Kennecott v. U.S. Department of the Interior* | 134 |
| 10.6.3 | 2008 Regulation Updates to Comply With *Ohio* and *Kennecott* | 136 |
| 10.7 | *Development of OPA Regulations* | 137 |
| 10.7.1 | Monitoring Costs and Attorneys Fees | 137 |
| 10.7.2 | Residual Removal Authority | 138 |
| 10.7.3 | Contingent Valuation | 138 |
| 10.7.4 | Other Substantive Provisions Upheld | 138 |
| 10.7.5 | 2002 Regulatory Updates to Comply With *General Electric* | 139 |
| **Chapter 11 — Techniques in Injury Assessment** | | 141 |
| 11.1 | *Introduction* | 141 |
| 11.2 | *Definition of Injury* | 142 |
| 11.2.1 | Physical Injuries | 142 |
| 11.2.2 | Injury as Measured Through Services | 143 |
| 11.3 | *Injury Assessment Framework* | 143 |
| 11.3.1 | Develop a Management Plan | 144 |
| 11.3.2 | Designate an Appropriate Damage Assessment Team | 144 |
| 11.3.3 | Review Readily Available Information | 145 |
| 11.3.4 | Focus the Assessment: Identify Possible Injuries and Pathways and Consider Probable Area of Effect | 146 |
| 11.3.5 | Select Assessment Methods, Develop Work Plans, Begin to Identify Restoration Options | 149 |
| 11.4 | *Injury Assessment Methods and Considerations* | 150 |
| 11.4.1 | Methods to Determine Injury | 151 |
| 11.4.2 | Methods for Determining Baseline | 152 |
| 11.4.3 | Considerations in Study Design and Quality Assurance | 153 |
| 11.5 | *Summarizing the Results of the Injury Assessment and Connection With Damage Assessment* | 155 |
| 11.6 | *Conclusion* | 156 |
| **Chapter 12 — Coordination of CERCLA Remedial Actions and Natural Resource Injury Determinations** | | 157 |
| 12.1 | *Introduction* | 157 |
| 12.2 | *Why Coordination Is Important* | 157 |
| 12.3 | *Remedial Action Process* | 157 |
| 12.3.1 | Site Identification | 157 |
| 12.3.2 | Preliminary Assessment and Site Inspection | 159 |
| 12.3.3 | NPL Listing Decision | 159 |
| 12.3.4 | Remedial Investigation and Feasibility Study | 160 |
12.3.5 Record of Decision ................................................................. 160
12.3.6 Implementation of Cleanup—Remedial Design and Remedial Action ... 161

12.4 Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment .................................................. 161
12.4.1 Components of Risk Expression ................................................................. 162
12.4.2 Human Health Risk Assessment ................................................................. 162
12.4.3 Ecological Risk Assessment ........................................................................ 165
12.4.4 Current Status of Risk Assessment ............................................................... 167

12.5 Opportunities for Coordination of Remedial Investigations and NRDA s .......... 168
12.5.1 EPA Notice to and Involvement of Trustees in Remedial Action Activities ................................................................. 168
12.5.2 Remedial Investigation Characterization of the Nature and Extent of Contamination ........................................................................................................ 168
12.5.3 Risk Assessments and NRDA s: Differences and Opportunities ................. 169
12.5.4 Quality of the Remedial Action .................................................................... 171

12.6 Coordination Examples .................................................................................... 171
12.7 Challenges to Coordination ............................................................................. 171
12.8 Promising Next Steps for Coordination of ERAs and NRDA s ...................... 172

Chapter 13 — Tools and Techniques in Assigning Damage ........................................ 173
13.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 173
13.2 Important Concepts in Damage Determination ............................................... 173
13.2.1 Elements of Natural Resource Damage ..................................................... 174
13.2.2 The Evolution of Approaches to Damage Assessment .................................. 174
13.2.3 Scaling ...................................................................................................... 177
13.2.4 Baseline and Challenges Presented in a Changing Environment ................ 178

13.3 Restoration, Replacement, or Acquisition Cost and Primary Restoration .......... 180
13.3.1 Alternative Selection .................................................................................. 180
13.3.2 Cost Estimation ......................................................................................... 181

13.4 Interim Losses .................................................................................................. 182
13.4.1 Interim Losses Through Resource-to-Resource or Service-to-Service Approach .................................................................................................................. 183
13.4.2 Interim Losses Through Economic Valuation Techniques .......................... 188

13.5 Assessment Costs ............................................................................................. 197
13.5.1 Assessment Costs Under the CERCLA Regulations .................................. 198
13.5.2 Assessment Costs Under the OPA Regulations .......................................... 198

Chapter 14 — Restoration Planning and Implementation ......................................... 199
14.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 199
14.2 Restoration Objectives and Players

14.2.1 Objectives

14.2.2 Restoration Concepts and Approaches

14.2.3 Players—Trustees, Potentially Responsible Parties, and the Public

14.3 Restoration Plan Development and Selection: Steps in the Process

14.3.1 Form a Restoration Planning Team

14.3.2 Develop a Range of Restoration Alternatives

14.3.3 Apply Screening Criteria and Focus Planning Activities

14.3.4 Develop Better Information on Alternatives Passing the Screen

14.3.5 Scale the Alternatives

14.3.6 Apply Criteria and Identify a Preferred Restoration Alternative

14.3.7 Prepare a Draft Plan, Receive Comment, and Prepare a Final Plan

14.4 Resolution of Liability and Restoration Implementation

14.4.1 Implementation—The Choice for PRPs

14.5 Illustrative Examples of Restoration Actions

14.5.1 Habitats

14.5.2 Resources

14.5.3 Restoration of Lost Services for Humans

14.6 Legal Considerations in Planning and Selection of a Restoration Plan

14.6.1 National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA)

14.6.2 Oil Pollution Act Requirements and Integration With the National Environmental Policy Act

14.6.3 Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act; Marine Protection, Research, and Sanctuaries Act; Clean Water Act; and National Park System Resources Protection Act

14.7 Legal Considerations in Restoration Implementation

14.7.1 Potentially Relevant Federal Laws

14.7.2 State, Local, and Tribal Requirements

Chapter 15 — Cooperative Assessments

15.1 Introduction

15.2 The Cooperative Assessment Approach

15.2.1 The Cooperative Assessment Agreement: A Framework

15.2.2 Injury Determination and Restoration Planning
15.2.3 Resolution of Liability and Restoration Implementation ........................................... 244

15.3 Considerations and Issues in Cooperative Assessment .................................................... 245

15.3.1 Considerations ............................................................................................................. 245

15.3.2 Risks Associated With Cooperative Assessments ...................................................... 250

15.3.3 Benefits of Cooperative Assessments ......................................................................... 251

15.4 Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 252

Appendices

1. Table of State NRDA Authorities and Trustees ................................................................. 253


5. Example Outline of a Damage Assessment and Restoration Plan and Environmental Assessment (Bermuda Islander Spill, Delaware Bay, Jan. 2013) ................. 341

6. Natural Resource Damage Claims Division, National Pollution Funds Center, U.S. Coast Guard, Natural Resource Damage Funding Guidelines (Mar. 2003) ........ 379

7. National Pollution Funds Center, U.S. Coast Guard, Claimant’s Information Guide (Nov. 2009) ......................................................................................................................... 403

8. Example Preassessment Screen (Sweet Water Mine, June 2008) ..................................... 431


10. Example Invitation to Participate in a Natural Resource Damages Assessment ............... 479

11. Example Notice of Intent to Conduct Restoration Planning (BP Oil Spill, Sept. 27, 2010) ................................................................................................................................. 483

12. Example Cooperative NRDA Assessment (MV Cape Flattery Oil Spill, 2005) ............... 509

13. Example Consent Decree Under CERCLA (United States v. Cosco Busan et al., No. C 07-60450-SC (N.D. Cal. 2008)) ................................................................. 525

Online appendices referenced in this book can be found at www.eli.org/NRDA2d