Contents

About the Authors.................................................................................. xvii

Acknowledgements................................................................................ xvi

Theme One: The Environmental Rule of Law........................................ 1

Chapter I: The Environmental Paradigm ............................................ 1
  Introduction—Utopian, Analytical, and Paradigmatic Phase .......... 2
  Part One—Nature as a Scarce Resource......................................... 3
    I. Nature as Fragile and in Need of Protection ..................... 4
    II. Nature as a Scarce Resource ........................................... 4
    III. Data on the Environmental Crisis ............................... 5
      1. Homogeneity Makes Progress Over Diversity ............ 5
      2. Pollution Spreads ..................................................... 7
      3. Imbalance Displaces Balance ................................. 10
      4. Acceleration Displaces Foresight .............................. 11
  Part Two—Conflict and False Dilemmas ...................................... 13
    I. Declaratory Consensus and Practical Dissent ................. 13
    II. Intergenerational Conflict ........................................... 15
    III. Intragenerational Conflict ......................................... 17
    IV. Equality vs. Environment .......................................... 18
    V. Development vs. Environment ..................................... 19
    VI. Irresolvable Conflicts and Polarisation ........................ 20
  Part Three—The Environmental Paradigm ................................... 22
    I. Need for an Environmental Paradigm ........................... 22
    II. The Notion of System ............................................... 23
    III. The Notion of Collective Action .................................. 25
    IV. The Anthropocentric and Geocentric Model ................. 26
    V. Communicability With the Principles of Nature ............... 27
      1. Resilience ............................................................... 28
      2. Biophilia ............................................................... 29
      3. Cooperation .......................................................... 30
3. Non-Exclusion of Beneficiaries: All Individuals Have Usage Rights and Thus Cannot Be Excluded. ..................60
4. Regulatory Status: The Collective Good Is Legally Recognised ............................................................... 60
5. Objective Classification: A Good Is Classified as Collective by a Regulatory Designation That Is Objective as Opposed to Subjective .................................................. 60
6. Diffuse or Collective Standing to Sue: These Goods Are Protected by a Broad Standing to Sue ..........61
7. Precedence of Preventive Protection: To Protect These Goods, Prevention and Precaution Must Take Priority Over Reparation ................................................................. 61
9. Position in the Social Sphere: These Goods Belong to the Social Protection Sphere .......................... 62

II. Duties, Limits, and Typical Fundamental Rights ....... 62

III. Notion of Environment ................................................. 64

Part Two—The Environment and Actions ...................... 66
I. Actions According to Conflicts .................................... 66
II. The Legal Definition of Rights .................................. 69
  1. Outline ..................................................................... 69
  2. Rights Over Individual Legal Goods ......................... 71
  3. Rights Over Common Legal Goods ............................ 72
  4. Rights Over Homogeneous Individual Interests .......... 72

III. Civil and Commercial Code of Argentina ............... 73

Part Three—Nature as a Subject ..................................... 75

Chapter IV: Principles and Directives ............................. 79
I. Introduction .................................................................. 80
II. Legal Definition of Principles and Values .................. 80
  1. Principles .................................................................. 80
  2. Values .................................................................... 82
III. Acceptance in Environmental Law ........................................ 82
   1. International Sources ................................................ 82
   2. Argentine Law .......................................................... 85
   3. Legal Effects ............................................................ 85

IV. Description of Environmental Principles ................................. 86
   1. Principle of Consistency .............................................. 87
      a) Enunciation and Effects ......................................... 87
      b) Consistency in Terms of Procedural Rule ................. 88
   2. Principle of Prevention ............................................. 89
   3. Precautionary Principle ............................................. 90
   4. Principle of Progressivity .......................................... 91
   5. Principle of Responsibility ....................................... 92
   6. Principle of Subsidiarity .......................................... 93
   7. Principle of Sustainability ....................................... 93
   8. Principle of Intergenerational Equity ........................... 95
   9. Principle of Solidarity ............................................ 95
  10. Principle of Cooperation ........................................... 96
  11. “In Dubio Pro Natura” ............................................. 96

V. Principle of Non-Regression ................................................ 97
   1. The Regression of Environmental Law ........................... 97
   2. Principal Traits .................................................... 98
   3. Principle of Progressivity ....................................... 99
   4. Sustainable and Lasting Development .......................... 99
   5. Legal Effects ....................................................... 100
      a) Unjustifiably Regressive Law ................................. 101
      b) The Most Favourable Interpretation ..................... 101
      c) In Relation to Public Policy ................................. 102

Chapter V: Principles of Prevention and Precaution .................... 103

Introduction ........................................................................ 104

I. Emotional Consensus and Cognitive Dissent ......................... 107
II. Interventionist, Preventive and Precautionary ...................... 109
III. Precedents ..................................................................... 110
IV. Description ..................................................................... 111
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V. Questions</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part One—Legal Classification</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Is It an Obligation or a Voluntary Option?</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Are They Aimed at Civil Servants or do They Extend to Ordinary Citizens?</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. What Is Their Effect on Public Policy?</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. What Is the Content of the Principle?</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Constitutional Basis</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Undetermined legal Description</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Different Weighting Depending on the Goods Compromised</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. What Are the Premises for Application?</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Threat of Serious or Irreversible Damage</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Scientific Uncertainty</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part Two—Applying the Principle</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. It Is Case-Dependent</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Reducing Uncertainty</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Transferring the Risk of Doubt</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Transferring the Risk of Scientific Error. False Positives and False Negatives</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Transferring the Risk in Delay</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Transferring Probative Risk</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Dynamic and Adaptive Application</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Transferring Development Risk</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Equity and Non-Discrimination</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part Three—The Balance Between Risk And Benefit</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Admissibility of the Risk-Benefit Balance</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Status of Non-Evaluative Procedural Technique</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The Non-Emotional Analytical Method</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The Procedure</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Identify Probability Margins</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. There Must Be an Evaluation of The Relative Benefits for the Relevant Parties</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. There Must Be an Examination of the Comparative Costs of the Various Alternatives.................127
4. Previous Experiences Must Be Assessed to Ensure Consistency of Action............................128
5. Step-by-Step Experimentation..........................128
6. Intra- and Intergenerational Comparisons............128

V. Public Control......................................................129
1. The Process of Moral Deliberation...............129
2. The Crisis in Decision-Making Processes........130
3. Intensive Democracy........................................130

VI. Risk Control and Management.........................131

Part Four—Paradigm Shifts ..................................133
I. Legal Security .................................................134
II. From Reparation to Anticipation.....................134
III. The Anchor Paradigm........................................135

Chapter VI: The Environmental Function...............137
I. Introduction......................................................137
II. Harmonisation Between Individual and Collective Rights.........................................................139
1. Framing the Conflict ........................................139
2. Reconciliation Rules in the Argentine Civil and Commercial Code..................................141
III. Private Property.................................................143
1. Original Ethos ...............................................143
2. Some Branches.............................................144
IV. The Contract.......................................................145
1. Protecting Free Will and Individual Freedoms.....145
2. Influence of Public Policy and the Theory of Fundamental Rights in Contract Law..........147
3. Environmental Function of the Contract............149
V. Sustainable Consumption....................................151
1. Framing the Conflict ........................................151
2. Some Declarations ........................................153
Chapter VII: The Regulation of Water and the Landscape .......... 157
Part One—The Regulation of Water .......................................... 159
I. Introduction ........................................................................... 159
II. What *Was* Water for the Law? .......................................... 160
   1. The Ownership and Anthropocentric Model ................. 160
   2. Thing Liable to Appropriation: *Res Commercium* .. 160
   3. Limits to Appropriation .............................................. 161
   4. Desacralisation of Water ............................................. 161
   5. The Environmental Issue Focused on Human Public Health .................................................. 162
   6. Independent Public and Private Spheres ...................... 163
   7. Protected Legal Good .................................................... 163
   8. Types of Norms: Predominance of the Subjective Right ...................................................... 163
   9. Legal Sources .............................................................. 164
III. What *Is* Water for the Law? ............................................. 164
   1. Awareness That Water Is a Scarce Resource ............ 164
   2. The Focus Shifts to Usage .......................................... 164
   3. The Imposition of Limits on Industrial Development and the Ownership Model ........ 166
   4. Regulatory Sources ..................................................... 167
      a) Constitution .......................................................... 167
      b) Special Legislation ................................................ 167
   5. Type of Norms ............................................................ 168
   6. Protected Legal Good .................................................... 168
IV. What Will Happen? ............................................................. 168
   1. Water as an Issue That Generates Legal Adjudication Models ........................................... 168
   2. Allocation Through the Market .................................... 170
      a) Analogy Between Land and Water ...................... 170
      b) Criticism of Socialism Over Land and Water .... 170
   3. The Water Ownership Rights Model .......................... 171
   4. Individual Freedom and Ownership Must Be Respected .................................................... 171
5. Criticism ................................................................. 172
6. Water as a Collective Good in the Social Sphere .... 172
7. Water as a Good Belonging to the Social or Collective Sphere ......................................................... 172
8. Replacement of the Anthropocentric Model .......... 173
9. Logical Hierarchy in the Clash of Rights .............. 173
10. Environmental Function of Property Rights .......... 174
11. Fundamental Right to Access Drinking Water ...... 174
12. Protected Goods and Types of Norm ................. 174

Part Two—The Atuel River Case ........................................... 175
I. The Atuel River: An Introduction to the Case ......... 175
II. The Claim Brought by La Pampa in 2014 That Gives Rise to This Ruling ........................................... 177
III. The Absolute Jurisdiction of the Court ............... 178
IV. Rejection of the Double Jeopardy Principle .......... 178
V. The Human Right to Access Drinking Water ......... 179
VI. The Fight Against Desertification in the Region .... 179
VII. The Holistic View of the River Basin ................. 180
VIII. The Interprovincial Committee for the Lower Atuel (CIAI) ................................................................. 180
IX. Conclusion .............................................................. 181

Part Three—Brasilia Declaration of Judges on Water Justice (Declaration Comprising 10 Principles) ..................... 182

Part Four—The Landscape: A Challenge in the Legal Theory of Environmental Law ........................................ 187
I. Reasons for Its Legal Relevance. Vulnerability of the Landscape ............................................................. 188
II. The First Regulatory Approaches .............................. 188
1. Neighbourly Relations ............................................. 188
2. Preservation of Historical and Cultural Urban Heritage ............................................................................... 189
III. Legal Definitions of Landscape ............................... 189
1. General Approximations ........................................... 189
2. Natural and Cultural Good ..................................... 190
Table of Contents

3. It Is an Environmental Sub-System of a Relational Nature ................................................................. 191
4. Landscape, Environment, and Biodiversity .............. 191
5. Delimiting the Landscape: Spatial-Temporal Difficulties ...................................................................... 191
6. Landscape and Heritage ................................................. 192
7. Subjective and Objective Dimension: Social Concept of Landscape..................................................... 193
8. Conclusions .................................................................. 193

IV. Case Law ...................................................................... 194
1. Aesthetic Values of a Park. Failure of the State to Provide Protection ......................................................... 194
2. Construction of a Pelota Court That Blights the Neighbourhood ............................................................. 195
3. Construction of a Tower That Affects the Appearance of a Historic Monument ...................................... 196
4. Works That Impact on Historical and Cultural Memory ............................................................................. 196
5. The Wall That Impedes the View of the Sea ............ 197
6. Work That Reduces the Value of Property by Affecting the View of the River ........................................... 198
7. Overhead Power Cables That Affect the Mountain Landscape .................................................................. 198
8. From the Case Law of Oaxaca de Juárez, Mexico. Refusal of a Request for Permission to Build a Fast-Food Restaurant in a Historic Cultural Centre ...... 199
9. Demolition of a Historic House in the Flores District ............................................................................. 206
10. Provincial Superior Court of Justice (STJ) Judgements ................................................................. 207

Theme Three: Implementing Environmental Law ................. 211

Chapter VIII: Voluntary Implementation .............................. 211

I. Introduction ........................................................................ 212
II. Implementation Theory ..................................................... 212
1. Voluntary Compliance .............................................. 212  
2. Enforcement .......................................................... 213  
3. Deterrence .............................................................. 214  

III. The Problem of Inefficacy ............................................. 214  
1. Declaratory Legislation ............................................. 215  
2. Collective Goods....................................................... 216  

IV. Voluntary Compliance .................................................. 217  
1. Institutional Context: Confidence and Transaction Costs ............................................................ 217  
2. Building Social Capital ............................................. 219  
3. Principles of Good Governance................................. 220  
4. Market Regulation ................................................... 220  

V. Compliance Programmes.................................................. 221  
1. Establishment of Intermediate and Final Objectives ............................................................. 222  
2. “Command-Control” Techniques.................................. 222  
3. Cultural Incentives.................................................. 223  
4. Measuring Success................................................ 223  
5. Identification of Subjects Mandated by the Regulation .......................................................... 223  
6. Identification of Complementary Roles......................... 223  
7. Compliance Monitoring by a Clearly Identified Authority ........................................................ 224  
8. Precise Definition of Powers for Applying Penalties.......................................................... 225  

VI. Conclusion.................................................................... 225  

Chapter IX: The Civil Liability System for Environmental Damage .............................................................................. 227  
I. Introduction..................................................................... 227  
1. New Frontiers in Civil Liability........................................ 228  
2. Multifunctionality of the System................................. 229  
II. Preventive Function ..................................................... 231  
1. General Duty to Prevent Damage................................. 231  
2. Preventive Action.................................................. 232
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III. Remedial Function</th>
<th>235</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Restoration. Remedying Environmental Damage</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Quantification of Collective Environmental Damage</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Punitive Function or Dissuasive Pecuniary Penalty</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Purpose and Objectives of the Concept</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Assumptions and Admissibility Requirements</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Precautionary Function</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Bases</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Effects on the General Civil Liability System</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter X: Civil Liability Assumptions

| I. Introduction                             | 247 |
| II. Damage                                 | 248 |
| 1. Concept and Type                        | 248 |
| 2. Specific Characteristics of Environmental Damage | 250 |
| III. Unlawfulness                          | 251 |
| 1. Expanding the Boundaries of Unlawfulness | 251 |
| 2. Restrictive Interpretation of Justification | 254 |
| IV. Causal Link                            | 257 |
| 1. Notion and Specificities                | 257 |
| 2. Proving a Causal Link                   | 260 |
| V. Attribution Factors                     | 262 |
| 1. Concept and Specificities               | 262 |
| 2. Restrictive Interpretation of Exemptions | 263 |
| 3. Cases of Joint and Several Liability    | 265 |
| VI. State Civil Liability for Environmental Damage | 267 |

Chapter XI: Environmental Class Actions

| I. Conflict and Proceedings                | 275 |
| II. Polycentric Proceedings                | 276 |
| III. Legal Standing                        | 279 |
| 1. The Notion of “Affected Party”         | 279 |
| 2. Public Legal Standing: The Ombudsman and Prosecutors | 282 |
3. Civil Society: Associations........................................... 283
4. The Notion of Collective Good in Relation to Legal
   Standing and Competence ............................................. 284

Chapter XII: The Judgement ............................................... 289

Part One—Characteristics of the Collective Judgement ............ 289

I. The Judgement on Individual Homogeneous Interests ........ 291
   1. Expansive Effects of the Judgement ........................... 291
      a) Judgement in favour of the claim ........................... 292
      b) Judgement rejecting the claim .............................. 292
      c) Judgement rejecting the claim due to lack of evidence ................................................................................. 292
      d) Res judicata in environmental matters ................. 292
   2. Multiple Proceedings and Lis Pendens ....................... 293

II. The Judgement on Collective Goods ................................. 296

Part Two—Atypical Judgements ............................................ 296

I. Distinction Between a Declaratory Judgement and an
   Enforced Judgement ........................................................... 296
   1. Declaratory Judgement ........................................... 297
   2. Enforced Judgement ................................................ 298

II. Exhortations ................................................................. 298

III. Interim Mandatory Injunction and Interim
    Prohibitory Injunction ................................................... 299

IV. Mandates Directed at Government ................................. 300
    1. Mandate Oriented Towards a Substantive Result ......... 301
    2. Mandate Oriented Towards the Mode of
       Implementation ......................................................... 301

V. Mandates Directed at Congress ..................................... 302

VI. Issues With Implementing Atypical Judgements ............... 302
    1. The Issue of Time in Implementation ....................... 302
    2. Implementation Guarantees. Creation of a Micro-
       Institutionality ......................................................... 305
    3. Orders Organising Implementation ........................... 306

Part Three—The Constitutional Problem ............................. 307
Appendix: Relevant Judgements In Comparative Law

Brazil ................................................................. 309
India ................................................................. 316
Netherlands ....................................................... 322
United Kingdom .................................................. 326
Canada ............................................................. 327
Pakistan ............................................................ 328
Inter-American Court of Human Rights .................. 329
Kenya ............................................................... 334
Thailand ............................................................. 334
Austria .............................................................. 335
Colombia .......................................................... 336
Germany .......................................................... 348
Portugal ............................................................ 349
Philippines ........................................................ 350
Belgium ............................................................ 351
Switzerland ....................................................... 353
New Zealand ..................................................... 354
Costa Rica ........................................................ 355
Jamaica ............................................................ 359
El Salvador ........................................................ 360
Mexico ............................................................. 363
Panama ............................................................ 369
Peru ................................................................. 373
China ............................................................... 389
United States .................................................... 392
Argentina ........................................................ 396
About the Authors

Ricardo Luis Lorenzetti is Justice of the Supreme Court of Argentina, Organization of American States Goodwill Ambassador for Environmental Justice, Member of the Interim Governing Committee Global Judicial Institute on the Environment, Director of the Master on Environmental Law at the University of Buenos Aires, Member of the Advisory Committee of United Nations Environment Programme, and Member of the World Commission on Environmental Law of the International Union for the Conservation of Nature.

Pablo Lorenzetti is Professor of the Master on Environmental Law at the University of Buenos Aires and the author of various books about environmental law.

Acknowledgements

We are grateful to Justice Antonio Herman Benjamin for sharing numerous experiences as brothers on the defense of the environment for 30 years. We also thank Alejandra Rabassa for her very close collaboration and the Environmental Law Institute for giving us the chance to publish this book so that we may spread our ideas to a broader audience.