

# Contents

About the Author .....	xi
Prologue and Acknowledgments.....	xiii
Introduction .....	xvii
Chapter 1. “Addition” .....	1
I. Legislative Use of “Addition” .....	1
II. Administrative Definition of “Addition” .....	7
III. Judicial Interpretation of “Addition” .....	8
A. Passive Point Sources .....	9
1. Additions From Circulated or Recirculated Water .....	11
a. Net/Gross Rule .....	11
b. Dams and Recirculation.....	14
c. EPA’s “Outside World” Theory of Addition ....	18
2. Additions From Stormwater Runoff.....	19
3. Additions From Water Transfers.....	24
a. Early Decisions .....	25
b. EPA’s Interpretive Memorandum and Water Transfer Rule .....	30
c. Post-Interpretive Memorandum and Water Transfer Rule Decisions .....	47
B. Indirect Additions.....	54
1. Indirect Additions From Land or Groundwater ....	54
2. Indirect Additions From the Air .....	55
C. Section 404 Decisions.....	66
1. Redeposit .....	68
2. Incidental Fallback.....	71
3. The Outside World, and the Unitary Navigable Waters Theories .....	73
IV. Conclusion.....	75

Chapter 2. “Pollutant” ..... 77

- I. Legislative and Administrative Definitions of Pollutant and Related Terms ..... 79
  - A. Statutory Definitions ..... 79
    - 1. Pollutant ..... 79
    - 2. Toxic Pollutant..... 80
    - 3. Pollution ..... 80
  - B. Legislative History ..... 81
- II. Judicial Interpretations of Pollutant ..... 83
  - A. Substances Held to Be a Pollutant or Not to Be a Pollutant..... 83
    - 1. Held to Be a Pollutant ..... 83
    - 2. Held Not to Be a Pollutant ..... 85
  - B. Listed Substances and Listed Categories of Substances ..... 85
    - 1. Waste Categories and Material Categories..... 87
      - a. Biological Materials..... 88
      - b. Consumer Products..... 91
        - i. Munitions ..... 92
        - ii. Pesticides..... 93
        - iii. Water Supply Treatment Residue..... 98
        - iv. Conclusion..... 99
  - C. Discharged Into Water..... 101
  - D. Must a Pollutant Cause Pollution? ..... 103
  - E. Must a Pollutant Be of Human Origin?..... 107
  - F. Potential Conflicts With Other CWA Sections ..... 107
    - 1. Section 311: Spills of Oil and Hazardous Materials..... 108
    - 2. Section 404: Dredged and Fill Material ..... 109
  - G. Potential Conflicts With Other Statutes..... 114
    - 1. Atomic Energy Act ..... 115
    - 2. FIFRA..... 116
    - 3. Refuse Act ..... 117
- III. Conclusion..... 118

Chapter 3. “Navigable Waters” .....	121
I. The Traditional Legal Meaning of Navigable Waters.....	125
II. Congressional Action: Statutory Definition and Legislative History of Navigable Waters .....	127
A. Statutory Definition.....	127
B. Legislative History .....	127
1. Section 402.....	127
2. Section 404.....	134
III. Administrative Action: Regulatory Definitions of Navigable Waters and Wetlands .....	139
A. Navigable Waters .....	139
B. Wetlands.....	143
IV. Judicial Interpretation of Navigable Waters Under the CWA .....	144
A. Tributaries and Wetlands .....	146
1. Tributaries.....	146
2. Wetlands.....	148
3. Pre- <i>Riverside Bayview</i> Decisions.....	148
a. Tributaries.....	149
b. Wetlands.....	149
4. <i>Riverside Bayview</i> and Subsequent Decisions .....	151
a. Tributaries.....	153
b. Wetlands.....	153
5. <i>SWANCC</i> and Subsequent Decisions.....	155
a. Tributaries.....	158
b. Wetlands.....	160
6. <i>Rapanos</i> and Subsequent Decisions.....	161
7. The Agencies’ Response to <i>SWANCC</i> and <i>Rapanos</i> .....	170
B. Isolated Waters.....	173
C. Groundwater.....	177
D. EPA’s Unitary Navigable Waters Theory and Water Transfer Rule .....	188
V. Conclusion.....	193

Chapter 4. “Point Source” .....	195
I. Congressional Action: The Statutory Definition and Legislative History of Point Source .....	195
A. Statutory Definition.....	195
B. Legislative History of Point Source .....	199
C. The CWA’s Structure: Point Source/Nonpoint Source Distinction .....	202
1. Regulation of Point Sources .....	203
2. Regulation of Nonpoint Sources .....	204
3. Regulation of Stormwater and Storm Sewers.....	207
4. Point Source/Nonpoint Source Distinction Left Unclear.....	209
II. Administrative Interpretations of Point Source.....	209
III. Judicial Interpretations of Point Source .....	213
A. Preliminary Matters .....	213
B. Held to Be Point Sources .....	214
C. Held Not to Be Point Sources .....	216
D. Easy Decisions, Difficult Decisions.....	217
E. Stormwater Runoff Decisions.....	218
1. Runoff .....	218
2. Getting Beyond Semantics: Dropping the Point Source/Nonpoint Source Distinction.....	220
3. The Factors Test .....	221
a. The Human Activity Factor .....	222
b. The Number of Sources Factor .....	224
c. The Artificial System Factor .....	227
d. The Nature of the Polluting Activity Factor .....	229
e. The Appropriate Control Factor .....	230
F. Non-Stormwater Runoff Decisions.....	231
1. The Curious Tales of Dams and Ditches .....	232
2. Vehicles on or in Land, Water, and Air .....	234
3. People and Other Animals .....	236

4. CAFOs, Fish-Raising Facilities, and Other Agricultural Discharges .....	239
IV. Conclusion.....	241
Chapter 5. Lessons In Statutory Interpretation .....	245
I. Conclusions Regarding Statutory Interpretation	
Generally .....	249
A. Depth of Legal Analysis Increases With Level of Court.....	249
B. Environmentally Positive Results Decrease With Level of Court.....	250
C. Courts Commonly Use Only a Small Number of Interpretive Devices .....	252
D. Uses of Interpretive Devices Change Over Time.....	255
E. Interpretive Devices Are Not All Outcome- Neutral .....	259
II. Comparative Statutory Interpretation: How and Why the Methods Used to Interpret Each Element Differ.....	261
A. How the Natures of the Elements Differ .....	261
B. How the Methods Used to Interpret Each Element Differ.....	262
1. Addition .....	262
2. Pollutant .....	265
3. Navigable Waters .....	267
4. Point Source .....	271
III. Conclusions .....	273
Table A: Decisions Interpreting the Elements of the Water Pollution Offense.....	277
Table B: Judicial Interpretations of Each Element .....	290
Table B: Addition.....	291
Table B: Pollutant.....	292
Table B: Navigable Waters.....	294
Table B: Point Source.....	298
Appendix I: EPA’s Regulatory Definition of “Navigable Waters” 40 C.F.R. §122.2.....	301